EVALUATION OF COST EFFECTIVENESS OF PERFORMANCE BASED MAINTENANCE CONTRACT



MASTER OF ENGINEERING IN HIGHWAY & TRAFFIC ENGINEERING

Department of Civil Engineering

University of Moratuwa Sri Lanka

February 2011

Declaration

I declare that this is my own work and this thesis/dissertation does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a Degree or Diploma in any University or other institute of higher learning and do the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except here the acknowledgement is made in the text.

	www.lib.mrt.ac.lk	
"I have supervised	and excepted this is thesis for the submis	ssion of the degree"
Signature of the su	upervisor:	Date:

University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.

Signature:

ABSTRACT

Road authorities around the world have been innovating and finding ways to cope with the high cost of road network maintenance, the growing demands of road users and the changing traffic type and volume. A well maintained road is needed to make the network sustainable for future generation.

The aim of this study is to evaluate the cost effectiveness of performance based maintenance contract for Provincial roads in Sri Lanka.

Four Type of maintenance methods were analyzed. Maintenance cost and condition of the road in each category were analyzed.

It was found that Performance Based maintenance contract method performed well low cost and good road condition. The road condition is maintained at good condition relative to the other method with low maintenance cost. And it was also founded that developed formula can be used for the road, when the overall damage percentages of the distress are given.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to the Supervisor, **Dr: W.K. Mapearachchi**, for all his guidance and patience throughout the course of this research.

I also would like to thank the evaluation committee for their suggestions and comments. I further wish to thank the staff member of transport Engineering Division for their support to prepare this thesis.

I also thank provincial Road Development authority (W.P)for sponsoring me to follow this course of studies and continuous support to carry out research work.

Finally I would like to thank my family members for helping to carryout the research in many ways.

Electronic Theses & Dissertations www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

EVALUATION OF COST EFFECTIVENESS OF PERFORMANCE BASED MAINTENANCE CONTRACT

By

R.M.N Thennakoonwela

Supervise by



The Dissertation Was Submitted To The Department Of Civil Engineering Of The University Of Moratuwa In Partial Fulfillment Of The Requirement For The Degree Of The Master Of Engineering In Highway & Traffic Engineering

Department of Civil Engineering
University of Moratuwa
February 2011

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 01	01
Introduction	01
1.0 Performance based maintenance contract	01
1.1 Importance of road maintenance	02
1.2 Type of maintenance	04
1.3 Annual maintenance budgets	05
1.4 Implementation of Maintenance Program	07
1.5 Main contract methods	08
1.6 Monitoring of performance based contract	10
1.7 Bidding process	12
1.8 Problem Statement	13
1.9 Objectives	13
1.10 Scope of the report	13
CHAPTER 2	14
Literature Review	14
2.1 History of the performance based maintenance contact	14
2.2 Main reasons for implementing performance contracts	16
2.3 Main characteristics of performance contracts	16
2.4 Implementation	22
2.5 Best practice in Performance based maintenance Contract in world	29
2.5.1 National road network in Uruguay	29
2.5.2 City of montevideo	29

2.5.3 Chad	30
2.5.4 Popayan Colombia.	31
2.6 Performance base maintenance system expereience in Western Pro-	
2.6.1. Direct labor	33
2.6.2 Maintenance contract System	33
2.6.3 Performance based maintenance work (contract)	33
2.6.4 Performance based (direct labor)	34
2.7 Compression of performance standers and responsetime	36
2.7.1 Poth hole	36
2.7.2 Edge repair	36
2.7.3 Surface Defects	36
2.7.4 Contract Period	37
2.7.5 Selection of contractors Theses & Dissertations www.lib.mrt.ac.lk	
CHAPTER 3	38
Review Of Road Maintenance Of Sri Lanka	38
3.1 Road network in Sri Lanka	38
3.1.1 Road development authority	38
3.1.2 Provincial council/ road development authority	39
3.1.3 Municipal council, Urban council	39
3.1.4 Pradesiya Saba And Other Roads	40
3.2 Funds for road maintenance	41
3.3 Maintenance of Provincial Road Network	42
3.4 Maintenance methods in western provincial road in Sri Lanka	43

CHAPTER 4	46
Methodlogy	46
4.1 Case A – Evaluation	46
4.1.1 Direct labour normal maintenance	46
4.1.2 Normal maintenance contract	47
4.1.3 Performance based contract	47
4.1.3.1 Patching of potholes	49
4.1.3.2 Shallow pothole	49
4.1.3.3 Medium Pothole	50
4.1.3.4 Deep Pothole	50
4.1.3.5 Edge repair	50
4.1.3.6 Surface defect	50
4.1.4 Performance based direct labour.	
4.2 Road Condition Evaluation	51
4.5 Road Condition Rating Analysis	52
CHAPTER 5	54
Field Data Collection For Maintenance Cost	54
5.1 Direct Labor Normal Maintenance	56
5.2 Normal Maintenance (Contract /Program)	57
5.3 Performance base maintenance contract (package)	57
5.4 Performance based maintenance contract direct labor unit	58
5.5 Field Data Collection – Damage Percentage	62
5.6 Comparison of Pavement Condition.	67

СН	APTER 6	69
Coı	nclusion and Recommendation	69
6	5.1 Summary	69
6	5.2 Conclusion and Recommendation	70
Ref	ference	71
AP	PENDIX	73
1.	Inspection Report Munagama Millewa Road	73
2.	Inspection Report Wewala Yalagala Road	74
3.	Inspection Report Werahena Gangabada Road	75



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 Maintenance annual allocation for past 10 years in Western Province
44
Figure 5.1 Direct labour maintenance cost during four month60
Figure 5.2 Contract maintenance cost during four month
Figure 5.3 Performance base maintenance cost during four month61
Figure 5.4 Performance base direct labour maintenance cost during four month
62
Figure 5.5 Road condition index vary with the month in each mainternance University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
method Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk Figure 5.6 Maintenance Cost vary with the month in each maintenance method
68

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1 Comparisons Of Contracts Conventional And Performance Base
Method9
Table 1.2 General Specifications of Performance Contract
Table 1.2 General Specifications of Ferformance Contract
Table 2.1 Performance Indicators in Latin America
Table 2.2 Contract Satandards and response times used in New Zealand19
Table 2.3 Evaluation Criteria and Weights Applied for the Award of the
Performance Contract of Washington D.C
Table 2.4 Performance Standards and response time used in Western Provincial
Roads
Table 3.1 Road maintenance method, allocation, road length, and improved road
length in each province in Sri Lanka
Table 4.1 Maintenance standard introduced by Provincial Road Development
Authority in Western Province. 48
Table 4.2 Selection of Rating for damage percentages52
Table 5.1 Road inventory data for selected roads
Table 5.2 2010 Cost Summary – for 2 Km Length in Rupees for Roads A,B,C
56

Table 5.3 Cost Summary for 2km Length in Rupees for Roads D,E,F
Table 5.4 Cost Summary 2009 for 2 km Length In Rupees for Roads G,H,I
Table 5.5 2010 Cost summary for 2km Length in Rupees for Roads J,K,L
Table 5.6 Cost Summary for all A,B,C,D,E,F,G,H,I,J,K,L roads in Rupees59
Table 5.7 Variables entered /removed
Table 5.8 Model Summary63
Table 5.9 Anova64
Table 5.10 Coefficient64
Table 5.11 Rating calculation for each method & each month65
Table 5.12 Rating calculation for each method and each month