COST OVERRUNS IN FORING FUNDED HIGHWAY PROJECTS IN SRI LANKA

H.H.N.A. Hettiarachchi

08 / 8841 - H



Master of Engineering in Highway & Traffic Engineering

Transport Engineering Division

Department of Civil Engineering

University of Moratuwa Sri Lanka

February 2011

COST OVERRUNS IN FORING FUNDED HIGHWAY PROJECTS IN SRI LANKA

H.H.N.A. Hettiarachchi

08 / 8841 - H



Thesis / Dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

Master of Engineering in Highway & Traffic Engineering

Department of Civil Engineering

University of Moratuwa Sri Lanka

February 2011

Declaration of the Candidate

I hereby affirm that this dissertation report is an outcome of my own effort for the best of my knowledge and it contains my own work done for the fulfillment of requirement for the higher Degree of Master of Engineering in Highway and Traffic Engineering. It does not include any written material previously submitted for the award of any preliminary degree, higher degree or diploma of a university or any other institution of higher education, or published by any other person or institution except where acknowledgment and references are made in the text.

.....

Hettiarachchi H.H.N.A. Department of Civil Engineering University of Moratuwa February 2011



Declaration of the Supervisor

I certify that the above statement is correct.

.....

Prof.J.M.S.J.Bandara
Transport Engineering Department
Department of Civil Engineering
February 2011



Dedication

This dissertation report is dedicated to my loving wife & daughter who always backed me up to fulfill my academics.



Acknowledgements

May this be a gratitude for all those who encouraged me and offered invaluable cooperation, advices, guidance and assistance to achieve my objective.

It is my foremost duty to devote special thanks to my supervisor Prof. Saman Bandara for the valued guidance offered. I pay my sincere thanks for the Transport Engineering Division of Department of Civil Engineering, University of Moratuwa for arranging this sort of highly demanded CPM course to the highway & traffic engineering industry and the panel of lectures; especially our course coordinator, Dr. M.A.W.Mampearachchi, Prof. Amal Kumarage, Dr. Lesly Ekanayake, Dr.Asoka Perera, Prof. S.A.S.Kulathilaka, Dr.Baskaran and other industry professionals who shared their knowledge and experience with us.

I very much appreciate my former employer, Mr.B.V.D.N.Chandrasiri [PD (MFAP)/RDA] for granting monetary assistance and official study leaves, despite the busy working schedule of the project division of the organization. And also my current employer, Mr. W. K. Kodituwakku [PD (NHSP)/RDA] for offering me official study leaves and assisting me in many ways. Further, I convey my thanking to all colleagues and subordinates who offered their dedication during my absence in my employer organization. Theses & Dissertations

I should pay special thanks on behalf of the cordial assistance granted by Mr. L. S. Premathilaka [DD (MFAP)/RDA], Mr. Kariyawasam [CQS, SWK/RDC], Mr. Jayarathne [QS, SWK/RDC] and also my colleague Ms. Jenifa Weerakoon [CE/ADB-RDA] during the data collection process.

I wish to thank Miss. Priyadharshni Gurusinghe [Civil Engineering Department/UOM] who devoted her valuable time for analyzing my data with SPSS software.

Ultimately, I make this an opportunity to appreciate each and every person who gave their assistance in every mean to achieve successful completion of this research.

Abstract

When an infrastructure development project is planned, an accurate estimation is critical. As a result of failing the fulfillment of expected accuracy, the cost overrun of the projects would result. The cost overrun is defined as a difference between the initial project estimate at the planning stage and the accounted project cost at the time of project completion. However, cost overrun is one of the major negative consequences that may influence to the economy of a developing country, like Sri Lanka. In order to fill the aforesaid financial gap, the necessity of pumping additional funds through the consolidated fund by the GOSL would be arisen.

Out of the significant impacts of which caused by cost overruns in foreign funded projects are delay in completion and curtailment of original scope of work. But both adverse impacts are restricted by the conditions and policies of funding agencies. It is the normal practice that influencing to complete the project up to the agreed scope under the specified standards by the funding agencies. Due to the fact that the highway projects would make greater impacts not only to the development of infrastructure but also to the higher cost overruns, it was decided to limit the analysis only for the highway projects.

The overlooked main factors that cause to turn the project into track of the cost overrun path are:

- Increase quantities
- Price Changes

However, there can have many factors that have supported above mentioned main factors. The objective of this research is to

- To study what is cost overrun?
- To identify factors behind cost overruns in Sri Lankan projects
- To identify main risk factors & risk management

The research would address the gap of knowledge of why highway projects overrun their cost. In addition to that, a method for minimizing cost overruns or identify cost overruns in advance will be proposed.

In this research, twenty numbers of cost overrun highway projects completed within resent years and funded by different agencies were collected and analyzed.

What are the main causes for cost overrun, how is a BoQ item correlate to each other item and what is relationship of cost overruns with project period or delay will be studied.

Key Words: Highway construction, project budgeting, inflation,

Table of Contents

Declaration of the Candidate	i
Declaration of the Supervisor	ii
Dedication iii	
Acknowledgements	iv
Abstract v	
Γable of contents	vi
List of Tables ix	
List of Figures x	
List of Appendixes	xi
List of Abbreviations	xii
CHAPTER 01 - INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 History & Background	1
1.2 Problem Definition	3
1.3 Objective	3
1.4 Scope Limitation & Assumptions	3
1.5 Thesis Organization	4
CHAPTER 02- LITERATURE REVIEW	5
2.1 Introduction	5
2.2 Definitions	5
2.2.1 Project	5
2.2.2 Project Management	5
2.2.3 Project Stakeholders	6
2.2.4 Project Risk	6
2.2.5 Risk Management	7
2.2.6 Nature of Risk	8
2.2.7 Risk Control Processes	9
2.3 Risk Engineering	9
2.4 Risk Assessments	9
2.5 Project Risk Management	10
2.6 Risk Distribution in Project Procurement	12
2.7 Delivery processes for projects	13
2.7.1 Design –Bid – Build (DBB- Traditional Method)	13

2	2.7.2	Design – Build (DB)	13
2.7.3 Design – Build –Operate -Maintain (DBOM)		Design – Build –Operate -Maintain (DBOM)	14
2.7.4 Design – Build –Finance - Operate (DBFO)			14
		Build – Own – Operate -Transfer (BOOT)	14
2	2.7.6	Construction Management (CM- At Free Agency)	14
2	2.7.7	Construction Management at Risk Advisor (CM- At Risk)	14
2.8	Imp	proving Project Delivery Methods for Risk	14
2.9	Fac	etors Influencing Costs	15
2.1	0 Cos	st Forecasting Models	16
2.1	1 Red	covery of cost overruns through contingency	18
2.1	2 Sur	nmary of Literature	21
CE	IAPTE	CR 03- RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	22
3.1	Inti	oduction	22
3.2	Res	search Strategy	22
3.3	Pro	cedure of Research	23
3	3.3.1	Step 1 – Establishment of Data Sources	23
3	3.3.2	Step 2 - Identification of Main Cost Overrun Factors from Collected Data	24
3	3.3.3	Step 3 – Factor Analysis	25
3	3.3.4	Step 4 – Data Analysis & Statistical Modeling	25
3.4	Sur	nmary	26
CE	IAPTE	CR 04- ANALYSIS OF DATA	27
4.1	Inti	oduction	27
4.2	Gro	ouping of Collected Data	27
4.3	Ide	ntification of main cost overrun factors	30
4.4	Fac	etor Analysis	32
4.5	Dat	ta Analysis and Statistical modeling.	34
4	1.5.1	Finding of Main Cost Overrun Factors	34
4	1.5.2	Findings of Correlations	35
	4.5.2. Flucti	1 Overall Cost Overrun with Cost Overruns of Road Pavement, Price, nation, Extra Works and Delay	35
	4.5.2.	2 Overall Cost Overrun with Original BOQ and Delay	35
	4.5.2.	3 Overall Cost Overrun with Contract Period and Delay	36
	4.5.2.	4 Overall Cost Overrun with Original and Final Rates per unit Construction.	36
	4.5.2.	5 Overall Cost Overrun with Terrain	36

4.5.2.6 % Overall Cost Overrun with % Change (CO) of Individual Items	37
4.5.2.7 % Overall Cost Overrun with % of Items in Original BOQ (with out	
Contingency)	39
4.5.3 Findings of Relationships through Regression Analysis	39
4.5.3.1 Overall Cost Overrun with CO of Structures Road Pavement, Price Flu	,
Extra Works and Delay	39
4.5.3.2 Overall Cost Overrun with Original Grand Total (BOQ) and Delay	41
4.5.3.3 Overall Cost Overrun with Original Grand Total (BOQ)	42
4.5.3.4 % of Overall Cost Overrun with all Contribution Factors	43
CHAPTER 05-DISCUSSION, RECOMMANDATIONS AND CONCLUSI	ON 46
5.1 Introduction	46
5.2 Main Cost Overrun Factors	46
5.2.1 Price Fluctuation	46
5.2.2 Subsequent Scope Changes	47
5.2.2.1 Project Scope	47
5.2.2.2 Design Scope	48
5.2.2.3 Construction Scope wars its aff Maratussa, Sri Lanka	49
5.2.3 Errors in Designs & Contract Documents	
5.2.4 Unexpected Site / Weather conditions	50
5.2.5 Institutional delays	51
5.2.6 Disputes in Project Team	51
5.3 Results of Risk analysis	52
5.4 Results of Statistical Modeling	53
5.5 Discussions	56
5.6 Conclusions and Recommendations	58
REFERENCES	60
LIST OF ANNEXTURES	62

List of Tables

Table 2.5	: Sources of Common construction project risks	11
Table 4.2.1	: Grouping of projects as per terrain conditions	28
Table 4.2.2	: Grouping of projects as per period of period of execution	29
Table 4.3.1	: Main cost overrun factors	30
Table 4.3.2	: Index Matrix for main cost overrun factors	31
Table 4.5.2.4	(a) : Table of Correlations of Overall CO with Terrain	36
Table of 4.5.3	3.1 -1 Table of Regression Results of Overall CO with Main CO factors	40
Table of 4.5.3	3.1 -2 Table of Analyzed Variance of Overall CO with Main CO factors	40
Table of 4.5.3	3.1 -3 Table of Unusual observations of Overall CO with Main CO factors	40
Table 4.5.3.2	-1 Table of Regression Results of Overall CO with Original BOQ & Delay	y41
Table 4.5.3.2	-2 Table of Analyzed Variations of Overall CO with Original BOQ & Del	ay .41
Table 4.5.3.2	-3 Table of Unusually Observations of Overall CO with Original BOQ $\&$	Delay
		41
Table 4.5.3.3	-1 Table of Regression Results of Overall CO with Original BOQ	42
Table 4.5.3.3	-2 Table of Analyzed Variance of Overall CO with Original BOQ	42
Table 4.5.3.3	-3 Table of Unusually Observations of Overall CO with Original BOQ	42
Table 4.5.3. 4	1-1 Table of Model Summery for % of Overall CO with all Contribution fa	ctors
		43
Table 4.5.3.4	-2 Table of Coefficients for % of Overall CO with all Contribution factors	43
Table 5.2.1	: Table for influence of factors for cost overrun	46
Table 5.3.1	: Table for ranked principal cost overrun risk groups	52
Table 5.3.2	: Table for ranked cost overrun factors	53
Table 5.3.3	: Table for main cost overrun factors and their impacts	53

List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Traditional Project Development Phases				
Figure No. 4.4.1	Graph of Contract Amount vs. % of Total Cost Overrun	32		
Figure No. 4.4.2	Graph of Year of Completion vs. % of Cost Overrun due to Price			
Escalation	33			
Figure No. 4.4.3	Graph of Delay of Completion vs. % of Cost Overrun due to Price			
Escalation	33			
Figure No. 4.4.4	Graph of Delay of Completion vs. % of Overall Cost Overrun	34		
Figure No : 4.5.3.	4: Graph of % of Road Pavement VS % of CO with Original BOQ	44		



List of Appendixes

Annexure	1	-	Initial Data of Project Costs & Project Execution
Annexure	2	-	Project Execution Dates
Annexure	3	-	Summery of Project Cost Overruns
Annexure	4	-	Analysis of Project Cost Overrun related Factors
Annexure	5	-	Summery of Amount Contribution to Overall CO by all BoQ
			Items
Annexure	6	-	Percentage Contribution to Overall CO by Main CO Factors
Annexure	7	-	Relationships of Main CO Factors and Delay to Overall CO
Annexure	8	-	Relationships of Overall CO with Original BoQ & Delay
Annexure	9	-	Relationships of Overall CO with Contract Period & Delay
Annexure	10	-	Relationships of Overall CO with Original & Final Rates per
			Unit Construction
Annexure	11-1/2	2 -	Relationships of % Overall CO with Geometry
Annexure	12-1/8	S -	Relationships of Individual CO (Each BoQ Item) with Overall
			Fcotronic Theses & Dissertations
Annexure	13		Relationships of % Individual CO (Each BoQ Item) with
			Overall CO

List of Abbreviations

AACE - Association for Advancement of Cost Engineering

ADB - Asian Development Bank

ASCE - American Society of Civil Engineers

BoQ - Bill of Quantity

BOOT - Build Own Operate Transfer

CE - Chief Engineer

CEA - Central Environmental authority

CEB - Ceylon Electricity Board

CM - Construction Management

CPD - Continuing Professional Development

CQS - Chief Quantity Surveyor Joratuwa, Sri Lanka.

DB - Design Build onic Theses & Dissertations

www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

DBB - Design Bid Build

DBOM - Design Build Operate Maintain

DBFO - Design Build Finance Operate

DD - Deputy Director

EDCF - Economic Development Cooperation Fund

FIDIC - International Federation of Consulting Engineers

GOSL - Government of Sri Lanka

ICB - International Competitive Bidding

ICTAD - Institute of Construction Training and Development

LCB - Local Competitive Bidding

MFAP - Miscellaneous Foreign Aided Projects

MOHRD - Ministry of Highways & Road Development

NHSP - National Highways Sector Projects

NRMP - National Roads Master Plan

NWS&DB - National Water Supply & Drainage Board

PCA - Principal Component Analysis

PD - Project Director

PMBOK - Project Management Book of Knowledge

QS - Quantity Surveyor

RCC - Reinforced Cement Concrete

RDA - Road Development Authority

RDC - Recourses Development Consultants

RRM - Random Rubble Masonry

SLR - Sri Lankan Rupees

SLT - Sri Lanka Telecom To Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.

Electronic Theses & Dissertations

STDP - Southern Transport Development Project

SWK - Scott Wilson & Kirictpatric (Consultancy Firm)

TDCA – Transport Data Collection & Analysis