

**DISPUTES ARISING FROM VARIATIONS IN ROAD
CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS IN SRI LANKA**

JAYATHILAKA G.R.H.

(149113H)

Master of Science in Construction Law and Dispute Resolution

Department of Building Economics

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

JUNE 2018

**DISPUTES ARISING FROM VARIATIONS IN ROAD
CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS IN SRI LANKA**

JAYATHILAKA G.R.H.

(149113H)

Dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirement for the
Master of Science in Construction Law and Dispute Resolution

Department of Building Economics

University of Moratuwa
Sri Lanka

JUNE 2018

DECLARATION

I declare that this is my own work and this dissertation does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a Degree or Diploma in any other University or institute of higher learning and to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where the acknowledgement is made in the text.

Also, I hereby grant to University of Moratuwa the non-exclusive right to reproduce and distribute my dissertation, in whole or in part in print, electronic or other medium. I retain the right to use this content in whole or part in future works (such as articles or books).

.....

Jayathilaka G.R.H.

07.06.2018

Date

The above candidate has carried out research for the Masters dissertation under my supervision.

.....

Ch. QS. Prof. (Mrs.) B.A.K.S. Perera

Dissertation Supervisor

07.06.2018

Date

ABSTRACT

Disputes arising from variations in Road construction projects in Sri Lanka

Sri Lanka is rapidly developing from the infrastructure sector with the emergence of huge and highly costly road networks and highway projects. This complexity gives rise mostly to unwanted situation as variations together with their attached effects, and greater likelihood that they become time consuming and costly than as-planned projects. Therefore, dispute arises naturally from the construction process largely where players involved must coordinate their work in all stages.

On the other hand, though much literature had developed on the broad view on variations and disputes, there is no literature which deeply addresses disputes arising from the variations within the Sri Lankan road projects by analyzing the cases.

Therefore, this research aims to fill the gap of disputes arising from variations in road projects in Sri Lanka and to propose probable attributes towards managing of such disputes.

The research aim was approached through case studies based on three road projects. During the data collection, semi-structured interviews were conducted with top level professionals of all three projects who had participated in the dispute procedures adopted in the Contract. Thereafter, the gathered data was analyzed using content analysis and mapping techniques (with NVivo 2011).

Findings deeply revealed that the existing disputes arise from the variations in Sri Lankan road projects. Causes of variations, contractual provisions for the variations and effects and the disputes arising from such variations in existing practice are discussed. Finally suggest probable measures to manage such disputes by developing a frame work.

Keywords: Variations, Disputes, Roads projects Sri Lanka

DEDICATION

*May this work be
A dedication to
My beloved parents
&
all who wish for my success ...*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research is fulfilled with encouragement, ideas and ready assistance from all the devoted people. Sincere gratitude must be personally extended to them for the remarkable support given.

First and foremost, my special thanks go to Ch. QS. Prof. (Mrs) B.A.K.S. Perera, the dissertation supervisor, for her patience, assistance, encouragement and valuable guidance provided throughout the period of the research.

I would like to extend my grateful appreciation to the Head, Department of Building Economics, Dr. Yasangika Sandanayake giving the opportunity to undergo through the dissertation and for knowledge gained. Further thanks go to all the academic and non-academic staff of the Department of Building Economics, for their kind support given to make this piece of work success.

Further, my special thanks are conveyed to Mr. R.M.L.K. Jayasinghe, Mr. Ranga Senanayake, Mr. D. Ranathunge, Mrs. Wasana Rodrigo and Mrs. B.D.V. Gunasekara for valuable guidance provided and their continuing interest provided me with confidence and fortitude in moving the research through to completion.

My grateful thanks are forwarded to individuals in the construction organizations who generously gave their time in responding to the research interviews and giving permission to refer their documents.

Further, I would like to express my deep appreciation to my colleagues for their great help and encouragement and especially, I give my heartfelt gratitude to my parents, and my husband for their dearest support.

Jayathilaka G.R.H.

07 th June 2018

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>DECLARATION</i>	<i>i</i>
<i>ABSTRACT</i>	<i>ii</i>
<i>DEDICATION</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>TABLE OF CONTENTS</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>LIST OF FIGURES</i>	<i>viii</i>
<i>LIST OF TABLES</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</i>	<i>x</i>
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background.....	1
1.2 Problem Statement.....	3
1.3 Aim and Objectives.....	4
1.4 Research methodology.....	4
1.5 Scope and limitation.....	5
1.6 Chapter Breakdown.....	6
1.7 Summary of the Chapter.....	7
2. LITERATURE REVIEW	8
2.1 Introduction.....	8
2.2 Concept of Construction Variations.....	8
2.3 Definition of a Variation.....	9
2.4 Causes for Variations.....	10
2.4.1 Nature of variations in Roads Projects.....	15
2.5 Contractual provisions for variations.....	16
2.6 Effect of Variations.....	19

2.7 Disputes due to Variations	20
2.8 Reasons for Disputes.....	22
2.8.1 Disputes in Road Construction	25
2.9 Need of Managing Disputes.....	29
2.10 Conceptual model for Variations Disputes in Road Projects Sri Lanka	31
2.11 Summary of the Chapter	33
3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	34
3.1 Introduction.....	34
3.2 Research process	34
3.2.1 Identify Research Problem.....	35
3.2.2 Literature Review.....	36
3.2.3 Research Approaches	36
3.2.4 Data collection	40
3.2.5 Data analysis	42
3.3 Summary of the Chapter	45
4. ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS	46
4.1 Introduction.....	46
4.2 Analysis of Cases	46
4.2.1 Cross case Analysis.....	47
4.2.2 Case Studies Description.....	47
4.3 Cross case Analysis.....	49
4.3.1 Variations in road construction projects Sri Lanka.....	49
4.3.2 Disputes arising from Variations in Road Projects Sri Lanka	60
4.3.3 Managing Disputes arising from variations in Road Projects Sri Lanka ..	73
4.4 Developing a Frame work.....	75
4.5 Summary of the Chapter	77

5. CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS	78
5.1 Introduction.....	78
5.2 Conclusions under the research objectives	78
Objective 01: Identify the types of variations and contractual provisions related to the variation claims	78
Objective 02: Identify the reasons for disputes due to the variations	79
Objective 03: Identify the practical situations and causes which create disputes arising from variation in the road construction projects in Sri Lanka.	79
Objective 04: Identify the solutions to minimize the disputes due to variations.....	79
5.3 Recommendations	80
5.4 Research Limitations.....	81
5.5 Further Research Directions.....	82
REFERENCES.....	83
APPENDIX A : INTERVIEW GUIDELINES	91
APPENDIX B: EXAMPLE OF AN INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPT	98

LIST OF FIGURES

<i>Figure 1-1: Chapter Breakdown</i>	6
<i>Figure 2-1: Contribution of each factor to variation.....</i>	14
<i>Figure 2-2: Nature of variations in road projects, Sri Lanka.....</i>	15
<i>Figure 2-3: Ranking of causes of Disputes/Claims</i>	25
<i>Figure 2-4: Risk, Conflict, Claim and Dispute continuum.....</i>	26
<i>Figure 2-5: Critical factors of construction disputes in road projects</i>	27
<i>Figure 2-6: Risk Clarification Framework</i>	27
<i>Figure 2-7: Perceptions of variations of Roads Projects in Sri Lanka.....</i>	28
<i>Figure 2-8: Conflict, claims and disputes</i>	30
<i>Figure 2-9: Conceptual model for Variations Disputes in Road Projects Sri Lanka .</i>	32
<i>Figure 3-1 : Methodological framework for research.....</i>	35
<i>Figure 3-2 : Types of Research Approaches.....</i>	36
<i>Figure 3-3 : Unit of analysis</i>	39
<i>Figure 4-1: Coding structure used in analyzing empirical data.....</i>	47
<i>Figure 4-2: Graphical illustration of Types in Sources of variations in RP SL.....</i>	50
<i>Figure 4-3: Comparison of the types in sources of variations in Road Projects Sri Lanka.....</i>	51
<i>Figure 4-4: Expert Opinion on Contractual provision for Variations in Road Projects Sri Lanka</i>	55
<i>Figure 4-5: Situations for practical effects from Variations in Project B.....</i>	58
<i>Figure 4-6: Situations for practical effects from Variations in Project C.....</i>	59
<i>Figure 4-7: Percentage value for practical effects from Variations in Road Projects Sri Lanka</i>	60
<i>Figure 4-8: Disputes occurred in selected projects.....</i>	63
<i>Figure 4-9: Developed Frame work to Manage Variation Disputes in RP SL.....</i>	76

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2-1: Sources of Variations in Road Construction	11
Table 2-2: Various causes of variation order and their categorization	12
Table 2-3: Effects of Variations	19
Table 2-4: Reasons for Disputes	23
Table 3-1 : Common Differences between Quantitative and Qualitative Research ..	37
Table 3-2: Methods of data collection under case study	40
Table 3-3 : Interview description of the cases	42
Table 3-4 : Measures taken to ensure validity and reliability	45
Table 4-1 : Brief description about the selected projects	48
Table 4-2: Brief description to the selected experts for the interviews.....	48
Table 4-3: Types in Sources of variations in Road Projects SL	49
Table 4-4: Causes of variations in Road Projects Sri Lanka.....	51
Table 4-5: Sources of variations – Expert’s view (case studies)	53
Table 4-6: Effects of Variations Road Projects Sri Lanka.	56
Table 4-7: Effects of Variations Road Projects Sri Lanka Expert’s view.....	57
Table 4-8: Brief introduction to cases.....	61
Table 4-9: Common Disputes in the cases	63
Table 4-10 : Award as per Adjudicator's Decision to the Dispute items	71
Table 4-11: Expert’s suggestions to manage Disputes arising from Variations	75

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Description
ABC	Aggregate Base Course
BOQ	Bill of Quantities
CIDA	Construction Industry Development Authority
ICTAD	Institute of Construction Training and Development
FIDIC	Federation International De Ingenieros Consoltores
MH	Manhole
No. /Nr	Number
NWS&DB	National Water Supply & Drainage Board
RDA	Road Development Authority
RP	Road Projects
SBD	Standard Bidding Document
SL	Sri Lanka
Sqm/m ²	Square meter
VO	Variation Order