

**COMPARISON OF SHELL ELEMENT FORCES
OBTAINED THROUGH CLASSICAL ANALYSIS AND
COMPUTER SOFTWARE**

Sasini Chamintha Vithanage

(09/8932)



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

Degree of Master of Engineering in Structural Engineering design

Department of Civil Engineering

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

December2014

**COMPARISON OF SHELL ELEMENT FORCES
OBTAINED THROUGH CLASSICAL ANALYSIS AND
COMPUTER SOFTWARE**

Sasini Chamintha Vithanage

(09/8932)



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Master of
Engineering in Structural Engineering Design.

Department of Civil Engineering

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

December 2014

DECLARATION

I declare that this is my own work and this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a Degree or Diploma in any other university or institute of higher learning and to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where the acknowledgement is made in the text.

Also, I hereby grant to University of Moratuwa the non-exclusive right to reproduce and distribute my thesis, in whole or in part in print, electronic or other medium. I retain the right to use this content in whole or part in future works.

Signature: Date: .../.../.....

The above candidate has carried out research for the Degree of Master of Science in Structural Engineering Design under my supervision.



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

Signature: Date: .../.../.....

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

There are many people who have contributed in making this research and the accompanying thesis a reality, to whom I am very grateful.

Special thank goes to Professor S M A Nanayakkara, supervisor of this research for everything he has done for me to start a M Sc research in this very interesting topic. It is indeed his guidance, enthusiasm, constructive suggestions, encouragements and invaluable assistance given throughout made this thesis possible.

Then I would like to show my appreciation to Mr. B V D S Jayantikumara, the director, STRAD Consultants (Pte.) Ltd. for sponsoring the study. Also I appreciate his guidance and help in making this research a success.

I would like to thank academic and nonacademic staff of University of Moratuwa, for every help they extended to me.

Finally, I wish to express my appreciation to my family and friends for their support and encouragement.



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

ABSTRACT

The “intze” type water tanks are economical for storing large capacities of water. Therefore accurate analysis of these structures is essential.

Modern trend is to use computer software for analysis and design of structures. It is easy and time saving. There are many commercial software available for the structural analysis. However, the accuracy of the output of the software depends on how well the actual structure is modeled. All those software are finite element based. There are many types of finite elements developed for the purpose of structural modeling. These elements have their own advantages and limitations in different situations. Selection of correct type of element and proper fineness of mesh is very important in achieving accurate results.

The aim of this research is to study the proper type of finite element and the optimal fineness of mesh suitable for different types of shells. In this context, the results obtained using different type of finite elements and different fineness of mesh used for analysis of “intze” type water tower were compared with the results obtained through classical analysis.

A 1500m³ intze type water tank was selected as a structure to analyse and compare the results. First, the structure was analyzed using elastic theory of thin shells with certain approximations. Stress analysis of “intze” tanks is extremely complicated due to many degrees of redundancies.

The computer software “STAAD Pro” was used for the finite element modeling of the tank. Initially 2-noded beam elements and 4-noded plate bending elements were used to model the structure. Many different models were created modifying the initial model until a result which is well comparable with classical results is obtained.

Following models were created in “STAAD Pro”:

- Model 1. Beams were modeled as 2-noded beam elements and shells were modeled as 4-noded plate bending elements.
- Model 2. Vertical axis and horizontal axis bending moments were released from the 1st model.
- Model 3. Actual member eccentricities were given for the beams in 2nd model.
- Model 4. Both beams and shells were modeled as 4-noded plate bending elements.

By comparing the results of above 4 models with results obtained through classical analysis, most suitable model was identified. After identifying most suitable model representing the structure, following further studies were carried out.

- Model a) Use of 3-noded shell elements instead of 4-noded shell elements.
- Model b) Changing the fineness of the mesh to study the effect of element size in final results.

The results obtained were studied and made a conclusion on the suitability of different types of finite elements for different types of elements.

It has been found that the STAAD Pro model 3 is the better structural representation of actual structure. STAAD Pro model 3 is the model which has vertical and horizontal axis bending moments released and actual eccentricities were given at the member start node and end node of the ring beam elements. Shells are quadrilateral plate bending element as 4 nodes of the plate in every shell lie on same plane.

It has been also found that the convergence to actual result with increasing fineness of the mesh could not be found due to some of the restrictions in the STAAD Pro software itself.

Finally, comparing the time and tedious calculations in classical analysis which is prone to errors, analysis using computer software is the best way to analyse such structures with the adequate knowledge of structural behavior of the structure.



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration of the candidate and the supervisor.	i
Acknowledgement.	ii
Abstract	iii
Table of contents	v
List of figures	viii
List of tables.	x
1.0 Introduction	1
2.0 Objectives.	3
3.0 Methodology.	3
4.0 Selection of Finite Element Analysis package.	6
5.0 Literature review.	
5.1 Analysis of “Intze” type water tank using elastic theory of thin shells.	8
5.2 Finite element analysis.	9
5.3 Hybrid element formulation.	10
5.4 Theory behind STAAD Pro Software.	11
5.4.1 Plate and shell elements.	12
5.4.2 Geometry modeling considerations.	12
5.4.3 Theoretical basis.	14
5.4.3.1 Formulation of Stiffness Matrix.	15
5.4.3.1.1 Assumptions made in the analysis.	15
5.4.3.2 Basic Equations.	16
5.4.3.3 Method to solve for displacement.	16
5.4.3.4 Consideration of bandwidth.	17
5.4.3.5 Structural Integrity.	17
5.4.3.6 Mesh refinement.	17
5.4.3.7 Preferred Shapes.	17
5.4.4 The Distinguish features of finite elements used in STAAD Pro.	18
5.4.5 Output of element forces.	19
5.4.6 Limitations in using finite elements in STAAD Pro software.	20
6.0 Analysis of “Intze” type tank using shell theory.	
6.1 Analysis of spherical roof cylindrical wall joint.	23
6.2 Analysis of cylindrical wall conical shell joint.	30

6.3 Analysis of spherical bottom conical wall joint.	39
6.4 Forces acting on spherical roof dome.	51
6.5 Forces acting on cylindrical shell.	55
6.6 Forces acting on conical shell.	61
6.7 Forces acting on bottom sphere.	68
6.8 Forces acting on inner cylinder.	72
6.9 Forces acting on ring beams.	73
7.0 Analysis of “Intze” type tank using STAAD Pro software.	
7.1 Selection of finite element.	75
7.2 Degrees of freedom.	
7.2.1 Beam Elements.	75
7.2.2 Plate Elements.	76
7.3 STAAD Pro model 1.	76
7.4 STAAD Pro model 2.	78
7.5 STAAD Pro model 3.	78
7.6 STAAD Pro model 4.	78
7.0 Conclusion.	85
8.0 References.	86



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
 Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Typical “Intze” type water tank.	1
Figure 3.1: 1500m ³ “Intze” type water tank.	3
Figure 3.2: Forces acting on shell/ plate element.	4
Figure 5.1: One dimensional finite element.	9
Figure 5.2: Two dimensional finite element.	9
Figure 5.3: Three dimensional finite element.	9
Figure 5.4: Types of structures.	12
Figure 5.5: Fifth node or centre node of a plate element.	13
Figure 5.6: Correct node numbering.	13
Figure 5.7: Properly shaped plate elements.	13
Figure 5.8: Improperly shaped plate elements.	14
Figure 5.9: Completely quadratic assumed stress distribution for plane stress element	14
Figure 5.10: Completely quadratic assumed stress distribution for plate bending element	14
Figure 5.11: Direction and sense of the element stressed.	20
Figure 6.1: Main shell components and structural dimensions of the “Intze” type tank.	22
Figure 6.2: Forces acting on roof wall joint.	23
Figure 6.3: Forces acting on cylindrical wall conical shell joint.	30
Figure 6.4: Forces acting on spherical bottom conical wall joint.	39
Figure 6.5 Forces acting on spherical roof dome.	51

Figure 6.6: Forces acting on cylindrical shell.	55
Figure 6.7: Forces acting on conical shell.	61
Figure 6.8: Forces acting on bottom sphere.	68
Figure 6.9: Forces acting on ring beams.	73
Figure 7.1: Cylindrical shell with course mesh and fine mesh.	75
Figure 7.2: Beam element showing its degree of freedom.	75
Figure 7.3: Plate element showing its degree of freedom.	76
Figure 7.4: STAAD Pro Model.	76
Figure 7.5: Water pressure acting on different types of shells.	77



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

LIST OF TABLES

Table 6.1: Forces acting on spherical roof dome.	54
Table 6.2: N_{θ} acting on cylindrical shell.	58
Table 6.3: M_x acting on cylindrical shell.	59
Table 6.4: M_{θ} acting on cylindrical shell.	59
Table 6.5: Q_x acting on cylindrical shell.	60
Table 6.6: Forces acting on cylindrical shell.	60
Table 6.7: N_s acting on conical shell.	65
Table 6.8: N_{θ} acting on conical shell.	66
Table 6.9: M_s acting on conical shell.	67
Table 6.10: M_{θ} acting on conical shell.	67
Table 6.11: Q_s acting on conical shell.	67
Table 6.12: Forces acting on conical shell.	68
Table 6.13: N_{ϕ} acting on bottom sphere.	70
Table 6.14: N_{θ} acting bottom sphere .	70
Table 6.15: M_{ϕ} acting on bottom sphere.	70
Table 6.16: M_{θ} acting bottom sphere .	71
Table 6.17: Q_{ϕ} acting on bottom sphere.	71
Table 6.18: Forces acting on bottom sphere.	71
Table 6.19: Forces acting on bottom sphere.	73
Table 6.20: Forces acting on ring beams.	74
Table 7.1: Results obtained from STAAD Pro model 1.	79

Table 7.2: Results obtained from STAAD Pro model 2.	79
Table 7.3: Results obtained from STAAD Pro model 3.	80
Table 7.4: Results obtained from STAAD Pro model 4.	80
Table 7.5: Shell element forces for outer cylinder.	81
Table 7.6: Shell element forces for conical shell.	81
Table 7.7: Adjusted shell element forces for conical shell.	82
Table 7.8: Adjusted shell element forces for conical shell for model 3.	82
Table 7.9: Results obtained from STAAD Pro model 3-1.	83
Table 7.10: Results obtained from STAAD Pro model 3-2.	83



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk